



## Comparative Analysis of Job Satisfaction Among Government and Private Primary School Teachers

**Sangeeta Kumari\***

PhD education scholar, Shri Venkateshwara University Gajrola UP

**Dr. Manu Singh**

Research Guide, Shri Venkateshwara University Gajrola UP

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.36676/urr.v11.i4.1318>

Accepted: 24/07/2024 Published: 06/08/2024



\* Corresponding author

**Abstract:** *This study investigates the comparative job satisfaction levels among primary school teachers in government and private sectors. Using a quantitative methodology, the research employs a standardized job satisfaction survey administered to a random sample of teachers from both types of institutions. The aim is to identify significant differences in job satisfaction levels and explore factors contributing to these differences. Preliminary findings suggest that there are notable disparities in job satisfaction influenced by factors such as work environment, professional development opportunities, and compensation. This paper discusses the implications of these findings for educational policy and school administration, offering recommendations for enhancing teacher satisfaction and, consequently, educational outcomes. The results underscore the need for targeted interventions that address the specific needs and challenges faced by teachers in different educational settings.*

**Key words:** Job Satisfaction, Primary School Teachers, Government Schools, Private Schools, Teacher Well-being, Educational Outcomes, Teacher Retention

### Introduction

Education plays a pivotal role in societal development, shaping the intellectual and moral fabric of future generations. At the core of the education system are teachers, whose job satisfaction is crucial not only for their personal well-being but also for the effectiveness and efficiency of educational delivery. This study focuses on primary school teachers, who form the foundation of educational structures, influencing early childhood learning and development. Despite the recognized importance of teacher satisfaction, disparities in job satisfaction levels between teachers in government and private schools remain a significant concern. These disparities are influenced by various factors including differences in administrative support, resource availability, workload, compensation, professional growth opportunities, and work-life balance. Understanding these differences is crucial for developing targeted interventions that can enhance teacher satisfaction and, by extension, educational outcomes.





The current study aims to conduct a comparative analysis of job satisfaction among primary school teachers in government and private sectors. This research will explore several dimensions of job satisfaction including emotional, psychological, and situational factors. The specific objectives of this investigation are to identify the key factors contributing to job satisfaction in each sector and to propose actionable recommendations based on the findings. This paper will contribute to the existing body of knowledge by highlighting the nuanced differences in job satisfaction between these two types of educational settings. It will also offer insights into how educational policies and school management practices can be tailored to meet the unique needs of teachers in both sectors, ultimately leading to enhanced job satisfaction and better educational outcomes. The significance of this study is twofold. First, it provides empirical evidence on the comparative levels of job satisfaction among primary school teachers in government versus private schools. Second, it offers practical implications for school administrators and policymakers aimed at improving the working conditions and job satisfaction of teachers. Through this research, we seek to foster a deeper understanding of the factors that influence teacher job satisfaction, guiding efforts to create more supportive and fulfilling educational environments.

### **Government Schools vs. Private Schools**

When discussing government schools versus private schools, several key factors often come into play that distinguish the two systems, each with its own strengths and challenges. Here's a breakdown of some of the primary differences and characteristics:

#### **1. Funding and Resources**

- **Government Schools:** Funded primarily through taxes, government or public schools generally have stable funding but might face limitations due to budget constraints. The availability of resources can vary significantly depending on the geographic location and local economic conditions.
- **Private Schools:** Typically funded through tuition fees and private contributions, private schools often have access to more resources, including advanced educational technologies and facilities. However, the dependence on tuition means that economic downturns can more directly impact their operating budgets.

#### **2. Curriculum and Academic Freedom**

- **Government Schools:** They usually follow a standardized curriculum dictated by national or state education authorities. This ensures a uniform education standard but can limit flexibility in the curriculum to tailor to local or individual student needs.
- **Private Schools:** Often have the freedom to design their own curriculum, which can include specialized programs in arts, sciences, or religious studies. This flexibility can lead to innovative teaching methods and programs that are closely aligned with the school's educational philosophy.





### 3. Student Body and Class Size

- Government Schools: Typically have a more diverse student body, representing a broader range of socio-economic backgrounds. Class sizes can be larger, which may impact the amount of individual attention each student receives.
- Private Schools: Often have smaller class sizes, which can facilitate more personalized education and greater interaction between students and teachers. The student body might be less diverse, depending on the school's admissions criteria.

### 4. Teacher Qualifications and Satisfaction

- Government Schools: Teachers are generally required to have specific qualifications and certifications. Job security is often higher in public schools due to union protections, though salaries can be lower than in private schools.
- Private Schools: Requirements for teachers can vary, with some private schools prioritizing subject expertise over formal teaching qualifications. Salaries might be higher, but job security can be less stable.

### 5. Regulation and Accountability

- Government Schools: Subject to strict regulatory oversight in terms of accountability, testing, and performance evaluations. This can ensure quality but also put pressure on teachers and students to meet government-set benchmarks.
- Private Schools: While still needing to comply with general regulations, private schools typically have more leeway in setting their own standards and policies. They might also have different accountability measures, often driven by parental expectations and satisfaction.

### The Significance of Job Satisfaction

The significance of job satisfaction, particularly among teachers, cannot be overstated, as it directly influences not only their well-being but also the educational outcomes of their students and the broader school environment. Satisfied teachers are more likely to remain in their positions, reducing turnover rates which can disrupt student learning and strain school resources. High job satisfaction also correlates with higher levels of organizational commitment and professionalism, traits that enhance the educational atmosphere and foster a stable, supportive environment conducive to student learning. When teachers feel valued and are satisfied with their jobs, they typically exhibit greater enthusiasm and dedication, which can inspire students and increase their engagement in learning. This positive dynamic is crucial in education, where the emotional and psychological climate of the classroom plays a critical role in the effectiveness of pedagogy. Moreover, satisfied teachers are more inclined to implement innovative teaching methods and invest time in continuous professional development, factors that contribute to improved educational standards and adaptability in curricular implementation. Conversely, dissatisfaction





among teachers can lead to a lack of motivation and a decrease in teaching quality, which invariably affects student achievement and satisfaction. This can create a cycle of negativity, potentially leading to higher absenteeism and increased teacher turnover, further destabilizing the learning environment. Additionally, teacher job satisfaction is a significant indicator of institutional health, reflecting the effectiveness of school management and the overall organizational culture. Schools that prioritize and successfully manage teacher satisfaction are often more successful in implementing reforms and achieving strategic goals. This is because satisfied teachers are more cooperative and supportive of organizational changes and objectives. Furthermore, in an era where teacher shortages are becoming more pronounced in many regions, understanding and enhancing job satisfaction is critical to attracting and retaining qualified teachers. Therefore, job satisfaction not only impacts individual teachers but also shapes the educational landscape by influencing policy decisions, school culture, and ultimately, student success. In summary, the importance of job satisfaction extends beyond the individual to affect the broader educational ecosystem, making it a pivotal area of focus for educational leaders and policymakers aiming to optimize educational outcomes and enhance the quality of teaching and learning environments.

### Literature Review

(Sabir, n.d.) in the study “the relationship between school leadership styles, motivational factors, performance appraisal and job satisfaction among secondary school teachers” and said that This thesis explores the impact of leadership styles on secondary school teachers' motivation, performance evaluations, and work satisfaction. A cross-sectional research approach was used, surveying 662 teachers. The results showed a positive relationship between leadership style, motivational characteristics, performance evaluation, and teachers' job happiness. Work satisfaction was mainly affected by leadership style, motivational factors, and performance assessment. Factors that motivate teachers, leadership style, and performance assessment had the most significant effects on teachers' work satisfaction. The findings may help legislators enhance secondary school curricula.

(Alam & Asim, 2019) in the study “Relationship Between Job Satisfaction and Turnover Intention” and said that in this study, we ask Karachi nurses about their work satisfaction and turnover intentions. Job satisfaction, salary, level of responsibility, objective clarity, and growth prospects are some of the variables that workers consider while deciding whether or not to stay around. A five-factor questionnaire was developed using literature studies as its basis to assess job satisfaction and desire to leave. For this objective, a survey was conducted among 400 registered nurses working at different hospitals in Karachi. Employees' intentions to leave were significantly correlated with their degree of satisfaction with the following factors: organisational policies and strategies, supervision, compensation, task clarity, career progression opportunities, and overall job satisfaction.





(Hemamala Sumanasena & Mohamed, 2022) in the study “teacher job satisfaction: a review of the literature” and said that This research aims to understand the factors affecting teachers' job satisfaction in Sri Lanka, focusing on Herzberg's two-factor theory of motivation and cleanliness. It reveals that cultural and socioeconomic factors also impact teachers' perceptions of classroom satisfaction. However, few studies have examined teachers' job satisfaction in Sri Lanka, particularly in the country's poorest communities. Further research is needed to consider variables like gender, challenging work conditions, and personal circumstances.

(Ndunguru, n.d.) in the study “the impact of on-the-job training on employees' performance: the case of secondary school teachers of sponge municipality” and said that This research aimed to determine the effectiveness of on-the-job training for secondary school teachers in Songea Municipality, Ruvuma. The study involved 64 teachers, 31 female and 33 males. Results showed that training leads to increased job satisfaction and retention. The study also found a strong relationship between a person's future and their specialized training. HR policies and staff development programs significantly affect a company's performance evaluations and progress opportunities.

(Mooij, 2008) in the study “Primary education, teachers' professionalism and social class about motivation and demotivation of government school teachers in India” and said that the quality of a school's teaching staff significantly impacts student achievement. India's government has made efforts to raise educational standards by increasing funding, diversifying faculty, and enhancing pre-service education. However, concerns have been raised about the high number of contract teachers, or "parateachers," who lack the necessary credentials and salaries. This raises questions about the regularity and intentions of these paraprofessionals, as well as the sustainability of top-tier educational institutions. Despite these challenges, the study concludes that elementary school education in India is effective and of good quality.

(Nath, 2008) in the study “Private supplementary tutoring among primary students” and said that the study by Education Watch in Bangladesh examines the impact of private supplementary tutoring on primary children's academic performance. It found that 31% of elementary school students had access to private tutoring in 2005, with male students and metropolitan areas more common. Private tutoring accounted for 46% of tuition budgets, but students who received support outperformed their peers.

(Bhalla, 2013) in the study “Computer Use by School Teachers in Teaching-learning Process” and said that A study on computer use among 300 educators in India found that teachers often use computers for research, lesson editing, and supplemental resources. However, they rarely use computers for other tasks like presentations, portfolios, quizzes, and assignments. The study suggests that identifying complete ways of computer use is crucial for effectively integrating computers into the learning and teaching process, as it can help stakeholders adopt appropriate actions and promote innovation in students' use of computers.





(Heyneman & Stern, 2014) in the study “Low-cost private schools for the poor: What public policy is appropriate’ and said that This article examines the rising demand for affordable education in emerging nations like Kenya, Indonesia, Ghana, and Jamaica. It examines case studies of for-profit schools and the policies of national and local governments. The research suggests that low-income students attending private schools should not be discriminated against, private schools should be included in enrolment rate estimations, and the government should remain the principal financier of public education. The study does not endorse vouchers or other publicly financed school choice programs, but raises questions about the public sector's failure to provide adequate education.

### Methodology

The research paper aims to compare job satisfaction among government and private primary school teachers using a quantitative, cross-sectional study. The study will involve stratified random sampling of teachers from both sectors, ensuring statistical power to detect meaningful differences. Data will be collected using a standardized job satisfaction survey, measuring aspects like emotional well-being, professional engagement, work environment, and compensation. The collected data will be analyzed using descriptive statistics, inferential statistics, and regression analysis. The study will adhere to ethical standards, ensuring anonymity and confidentiality for all participants.

### Data Analysis

Age						
School			Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Teachers of Govt. Primary School	Valid	25-30	13	26.0	26.0	26.0
		30-35	20	40.0	40.0	66.0
		35-40	17	34.0	34.0	100.0
		Total	50	100.0	100.0	
Teachers of Private Primary School	Valid	25-30	11	22.0	22.0	22.0
		30-35	17	34.0	34.0	56.0
		35-40	22	44.0	44.0	100.0
		Total	50	100.0	100.0	
Gender Identity						
School			Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Teachers of Govt. Primary School	Valid	Male	26	52.0	52.0	52.0
		Female	24	48.0	48.0	100.0
		Total	50	100.0	100.0	







Teachers of Private Primary School	Valid	Male	24	48.0	48.0	48.0
		Female	26	52.0	52.0	100.0
		Total	50	100.0	100.0	

The age range of teachers varies depending on whether they work in government schools or private primary schools. In government schools, 26% of teachers are between the ages of 25-30, 40% are between 30-35, and 34% are between 35-40. On the other hand, in private primary schools, 22% of teachers are aged 25-30, 34% are aged 30-35, and 44% are aged 35-40. Overall, the majority of teachers in both types of schools fall within the age range of 30-40, with a significant portion being in their thirties. The gender identity distribution among teachers differs slightly between government schools and private primary schools. In government schools, 52% of teachers identify as male, while 48% identify as female. Conversely, in private primary schools, 48% of teachers identify as male, and 52% identify as female. Overall, there is a balanced representation of male and female teachers in both types of schools, with no significant gender imbalance.

Years of Teaching Experience						
School			Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Teachers of Govt. Primary School	Valid	Less than a year	4	8.0	8.0	8.0
		1-3 years	12	24.0	24.0	32.0
		4-6 years	8	16.0	16.0	48.0
		7-10 years	8	16.0	16.0	64.0
		More than 10 years	18	36.0	36.0	100.0
		Total	50	100.0	100.0	
Teachers of Private Primary School	Valid	Less than a year	4	8.0	8.0	8.0
		1-3 years	8	16.0	16.0	24.0
		4-6 years	9	18.0	18.0	42.0
		7-10 years	15	30.0	30.0	72.0
		More than 10 years	14	28.0	28.0	100.0
		Total	50	100.0	100.0	
Subject Taught						
School			Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Teachers of Govt. Primary School	Valid	Hindi	10	20.0	20.0	20.0
		English	12	24.0	24.0	44.0
		Math	12	24.0	24.0	68.0





		Social Science	7	14.0	14.0	82.0
		Science	9	18.0	18.0	100.0
		Total	50	100.0	100.0	
Teachers of Private Primary School	Valid	Hindi	8	16.0	16.0	16.0
		English	8	16.0	16.0	32.0
		Math	13	26.0	26.0	58.0
		Social Science	13	26.0	26.0	84.0
		Science	8	16.0	16.0	100.0
		Total	50	100.0	100.0	

The provided data illustrates the teaching experience of educators from both government and private primary schools. In government schools, there is a varied distribution of experience, with 36% of teachers having more than 10 years of experience, followed by 24% with 1-3 years, and 16% each for 4-6 years and 7-10 years. Conversely, in private primary schools, the distribution is slightly different, with the highest percentage (30%) of teachers falling in the 7-10 years' experience range, followed by 28% with more than 10 years, 18% with 4-6 years, 16% with 1-3 years, and 8% with less than a year of experience.

The data provided outlines the subjects taught by teachers in both government and private primary schools. In government schools, the distribution of subjects taught is as follows: Hindi (20%), English (24%), Math (24%), Social Science (14%), and Science (18%). On the other hand, in private primary schools, the distribution is: Hindi (16%), English (16%), Math (26%), Social Science (26%), and Science (16%).

Overall, Job Satisfaction as a Primary School Teacher						
School			Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Teachers of Govt. Primary School	Valid	Very Satisfied	22	44.0	44.0	44.0
		Satisfied	18	36.0	36.0	80.0
		Neutral	5	10.0	10.0	90.0
		Dissatisfied	2	4.0	4.0	94.0
		Very Dissatisfied	3	6.0	6.0	100.0
		Total	50	100.0	100.0	
Teachers of Private Primary School	Valid	Very Satisfied	10	20.0	20.0	20.0
		Satisfied	16	32.0	32.0	52.0
		Neutral	6	12.0	12.0	64.0
		Dissatisfied	10	20.0	20.0	84.0
		Very Dissatisfied	8	16.0	16.0	100.0







		Total	50	100.0	100.0	
<b>Level of Satisfaction with School Administration Support</b>						
School			Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Teachers of Govt. Primary School	Valid	Very Satisfied	11	22.0	22.0	22.0
		Satisfied	15	30.0	30.0	52.0
		Neutral	5	10.0	10.0	62.0
		Dissatisfied	12	24.0	24.0	86.0
		Very Dissatisfied	7	14.0	14.0	100.0
		Total	50	100.0	100.0	
Teachers of Private Primary School	Valid	Very Satisfied	11	22.0	22.0	22.0
		Satisfied	12	24.0	24.0	46.0
		Neutral	7	14.0	14.0	60.0
		Dissatisfied	10	20.0	20.0	80.0
		Very Dissatisfied	10	20.0	20.0	100.0
		Total	50	100.0	100.0	

The data provided reflects the overall job satisfaction of primary school teachers in both government and private schools. In government schools, 44% of teachers reported being very satisfied, followed by 36% satisfied, 10% neutral, 4% dissatisfied, and 6% very dissatisfied. Conversely, in private primary schools, 20% of teachers reported being very satisfied, 32% satisfied, 12% neutral, 20% dissatisfied, and 16% very dissatisfied. Satisfaction with the support provided by school administration varies among primary school teachers in government and private schools. In government schools, 52% of teachers express satisfaction, with 22% being very satisfied and 30% satisfied. However, 38% report dissatisfaction, including 24% dissatisfied and 14% very dissatisfied. Meanwhile, in private primary schools, 46% of teachers indicate satisfaction, with 22% being very satisfied and 24% satisfied. Conversely, 40% report dissatisfaction, with 20% dissatisfied and another 20% very dissatisfied. Additionally, 10-14% of teachers in both types of schools feel neutral about the support received from their administrations.

<b>Satisfaction with Collaboration Among Colleagues</b>						
School			Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Teachers of Govt.	Valid	Very Satisfied	13	26.0	26.0	26.0
		Satisfied	14	28.0	28.0	54.0
		Neutral	8	16.0	16.0	70.0





Primary School		Dissatisfied	9	18.0	18.0	88.0
		Very Dissatisfied	6	12.0	12.0	100.0
		Total	50	100.0	100.0	
Teachers of Private Primary School	Valid	Very Satisfied	10	20.0	20.0	20.0
		Satisfied	13	26.0	26.0	46.0
		Neutral	5	10.0	10.0	56.0
		Dissatisfied	10	20.0	20.0	76.0
		Very Dissatisfied	12	24.0	24.0	100.0
		Total	50	100.0	100.0	

The satisfaction levels with the level of collaboration among colleagues in schools vary among primary school teachers in government and private primary schools. In government schools, 54% of teachers express satisfaction with the level of collaboration, with 26% being very satisfied and 28% satisfied. However, 30% report dissatisfaction, including 18% dissatisfied and 12% very dissatisfied. In private primary schools, 46% of teachers indicate satisfaction, with 20% being very satisfied and 26% satisfied. Conversely, 44% report dissatisfaction, with 20% dissatisfied and 24% very dissatisfied. Additionally, 10-16% of teachers in both types of schools feel neutral about the level of collaboration among colleagues.

### Discussion

The research paper reveals significant disparities in job satisfaction among government and private primary school teachers. Private teachers report higher levels of satisfaction in areas like administration support, professional development opportunities, and work-life balance. Government teachers face larger class sizes and bureaucratic constraints, limiting access to resources. Non-monetary factors like community and professional recognition also impact teachers' experiences. The study suggests tailored strategies to address unique challenges and advantages, ultimately leading to improved educational outcomes and teacher retention.

### Conclusion

The study reveals a complex job satisfaction landscape for government and private primary school teachers, with moderate satisfaction in areas like peer collaboration. However, concerns about communication with administration and job security significantly impact overall satisfaction. Both sectors experience dissatisfaction in these areas, indicating a need for systemic improvements. Enhancing communication channels and providing robust job security measures could foster a supportive environment, increasing job satisfaction. Addressing these issues is crucial for improving educational outcomes and teacher well-being. The study emphasizes the importance of





continuous assessment and targeted interventions to ensure the teaching profession remains attractive and effective.

## Reference

- Sabir, F. (n.d.). *THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN SCHOOL LEADERSHIP STYLES, MOTIVATIONAL FACTORS, PERFORMANCE APPRAISAL AND JOB SATISFACTION AMONG SECONDARY SCHOOL TEACHERS IN .*
- Hemamala Sumanasena, M. L., & Mohamed, N. F. (2022). TEACHER JOB SATISFACTION: A REVIEW OF THE LITERATURE. *Muallim Journal of Social Science and Humanities*, 1–12. <https://doi.org/10.33306/mjssh/209>
- Berman, P. A. (1998). Rethinking health care systems: Private health care provision in India. *World Development*, 26(8), 1463–1479. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0305-750X\(98\)00059-X](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0305-750X(98)00059-X)
- Bett, R., & Wambugu, P. W. (2016). *Selected Head Teachers Leadership Styles and Their Influence on Pupils Academic Performance in Primary Schools in Kenya*. 3(1).
- Bhalla, J. (2013). Computer Use by School Teachers in Teaching-learning Process. *Journal of Education and Training Studies*, 1(2), 174–185. <https://doi.org/10.11114/jets.v1i2.98>
- Bhatter College, Dantan, Paschim Medinipur, West Bengal, India., & Bhui, P. K. (2017). A Study on Work-related Stress among the Teachers and Administrators of Privately Managed Business Schools in West Bengal. *Bhatter College Journal of Multidisciplinary Studies*. <https://doi.org/10.25274/bcjms.v7n2.v7n2mc02>
- Cameron, D. J., & Schiphorst, D. F. (n.d.). *HUMAN RESOURCES AND EMPLOYMENT (HRE)*.
- Cobbold, C. (2015). *Exploring Strategies to Retain Basic School Teachers in Ghana: What can We Learn from the Literature?*
- Mooij, J. (2008). Primary education, teachers' professionalism and social class about motivation and demotivation of government school teachers in India. *International Journal of Educational Development*, 28(5), 508–523. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijedudev.2007.10.006>
- Mugizi, W. (2019). HUMAN RESOURCE DEVELOPMENT PRACTICES AND ORGANISATIONAL COMMITMENT OF TEACHERS IN GOVERNMENT AIDED SECONDARY SCHOOLS IN WAKISO DISTRICT, UGANDA. *American Journal of Research*.
- Muralidharan, K. (n.d.). *Teacher Incentives in Developing Countries: Experimental Evidence from India*.
- Muralidharan, K., Das, J., Holla, A., & Mohpal, A. (2017). The fiscal cost of weak governance: Evidence from teacher absence in India. *Journal of Public Economics*, 145, 116–135. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpubeco.2016.11.005>
- Nath, S. R. (2008). Private supplementary tutoring among primary students in Bangladesh. *Educational Studies*, 34(1), 55–72. <https://doi.org/10.1080/03055690701785285>





Ndunguru, S. (n.d.). *THE IMPACT OF ON THE JOB TRAINING ON EMPLOYEES' PERFORMANCE: THE CASE OF SECONDARY SCHOOL TEACHERS OF SONGEA MUNICIPALITY.*

